

To: Mayor Bill de Blasio
cc: James Vacca, Chair, City Council Committee on Technology
Rick Chandler, Commissioner, Department of Buildings
Daniel Nigro, Commissioner, Fire Department of New York
Vincent Sapienza, Commissioner, Department of Environmental Protection

Every time a New Yorker calls 311, registers for a construction permit, or sees their streets cleaned, they are seeing government at work—and the creation of public data. Access to this data allows New Yorkers to understand what public institutions do and how tax dollars are spent. This kind of transparency is a priority of the City of New York, which in 2012 enacted its pioneering “Open Data Law,” requiring all City agencies to publish every public dataset they maintain on the Open Data Portal.

Five years after open data became law, the City’s Open Data Portal is home to more than 1,700 datasets spanning dozens of City agencies. The portal itself received an overhaul earlier this year, becoming even more user-friendly for data novices, all the better to welcome the 140,000 users who visit every month. New Yorkers—from sustainability researchers to interfaith organizers—are using data to help lift up their communities. Their engagement makes the program thrive.

Pursuant to Local Law 8 of 2016, the Mayor’s Office of Data Analytics (MODA) was tasked to conduct a series of examinations of City agencies’ data systems to verify their compliance with Local Law 11 of 2012, also known as the Open Data Law. Local Law 8 of 2016 names three agencies each year to be examined. We hereby submit MODA’s findings on the Department of Buildings (DOB), Department of Environmental Protection (DEP), and Fire Department (FDNY). This report also includes recommendations on improving the City’s overall compliance with the Open Data Law in line with the Administration’s *Open Data for All* vision.

Please find enclosed:

- Examination and Verification 2017 Findings Report
 - Examination and Verification Background and Process
 - Summary of Results
 - Recommendations for Better Citywide Compliance
- Department of Buildings (DOB) Open Data Compliance Workbook
- Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) Open Data Compliance Workbook
- Fire Department (FDNY) Open Data Compliance Workbook

Our ongoing partnership with the Open Data Coordinators and other Open Data stewards at participating agencies is helping MODA build a more transparent City government. We wish to thank them for their cooperation in this process and for continuing the good work to identify, prepare, and publish valuable datasets to the Open Data Portal.

- The Open Data team at the Mayor’s Office of Data Analytics

2017 Open Data Examination and Verification Report

Mayor's Office of Data Analytics (MODA)

Authors: Craig Campbell, Deena Patel

Date: December 1, 2017

The purpose of the Open Data Examination and Verification process is twofold: It allows MODA to critically examine three specific City agencies' data inventories and also holds up a mirror to the NYC Open Data program at large. In the five years since the Open Data Law passed, agencies have moved beyond any initial reluctance they may have had to publish data. With hundreds of datasets already on the Open Data Portal, the key challenge in years to come will be to synchronize Open Data with other data sharing processes to ensure the program thrives through changing political, personnel, and technological environments.

Key Findings

- The Department of Environmental Protection (DEP), the Fire Department (FDNY), and the Department of Buildings (DOB) fully complied with the requirements established in MODA's Examination and Verification plan.
- MODA's improved Examination and Verification process proved to be a beneficial tool to agency Open Data Coordinators (ODCs). Each agency identified new datasets to publish to the Open Data Portal.
- To be successful, Open Data should not be treated only as a reporting obligation, but as a key part of the larger technology, data governance, and data analytics roadmap at every City agency.
- Agencies cited organizational knowledge retention and justifying technological or personnel costs as the primary challenges they face as part of the Open Data Program.

Key Recommendations

- **The Mayor's Office should** regularly communicate the Administration's ongoing commitment to the Open Data Program as both a community empowerment initiative through *Open Data for All* and a data governance policy with well-documented return on investment.
- **MODA and DoITT should** help Open Data Coordinators develop strategies unique to the conditions at their own agencies and assist the onboarding of new ODCs.
- **Agencies should** have internal, cross-functional data governance teams that regularly convene and have Open Data on the agenda.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Examination and Verification Background and Process | 3 |
| Dataset Questionnaire | 3 |
| Organizational Chart | 4 |
| Executive Certification Letter | 4 |
| Dataset Requests | 4 |
| Debrief Interview | 4 |
| Summary of Results | 5 |
| Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) | 6 |
| Fire Department of New York (FDNY) | 7 |
| Department of Buildings (DOB) | 7 |
| Recommendations for Better Citywide Compliance | 8 |
| Each agency is unique | 8 |
| Executive buy-in is crucial | 8 |
| Open Data is an opportunity to teach users how City operations work | 9 |
| Open Data drives data governance and data analytics | 9 |
| Open Data coordinators must be well-networked | 9 |
| Organizational knowledge retention is a challenge | 10 |
| Recommended Reading | 10 |
| Appendices | 11 |
| Appendix A: Local Law 8 of 2016 | 11 |
| Appendix B: Executive Certification Letter template | 13 |
| Appendix C: Open Data Coordinator Debrief Interview Template | 14 |
| Appendix D: Open Data Coordinator Engagements in 2017 | 15 |

Examination and Verification Background and Process

In December 2015, the New York City Council passed Intro No. 916-A, which required an agency designated by the Mayor to conduct a series of examinations of mayoral City agencies' data systems to verify their compliance with the Open Data Law. The examinations would improve citywide compliance with the Law by creating a more systematic way to locate datasets that may have been excluded in agencies' self-reported Open Data compliance plans.

In January 2016, Mayor Bill de Blasio signed Int. No. 916-A into Local Law 8 of 2016 (**Appendix A**) and appointed the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics (MODA) to oversee the process. MODA then prepared an Examination and Verification (E&V) plan that, as specified by the law, was approved by the Commissioner of the Department of Investigation. The results of the first Examination and Verification for the Department of Sanitation (DSNY), Department of Correction (DOC), and Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) were submitted to City Council and the Mayor on December 1, 2016. These results can be found in the "Reports" section of <https://opendata.cityofnewyork.us/open-data-law/>.

Following this submission, MODA gathered feedback from the surveyed agencies, City Council, and the public Open Data community to develop an improved E&V process for the 2017 cycle. These changes included a more robust dataset questionnaire with additional sections on data quality and inter-agency data exchanges. In addition, this year's process included informational interviews with the surveyed agencies' Open Data Coordinators (ODCs) after they completed the questionnaire and an extended reporting timeline. This process was conducted in parallel to annual reporting requirements for the overall Open Data program to make it as efficient as possible for the surveyed agencies. This updated plan requires agency ODCs to complete the following tasks.

Dataset Questionnaire

In the 2016 Examination and Verification report, MODA found that the term "dataset" is loose; the same set of data records can be represented in single or multiple data tables, at multiple levels of granularity, and may be stored in different data formats in a database or in a custom-made data system. To accommodate this definitional problem, MODA requires agencies to examine the *existing* instances at their agencies where data assets are created and exchanged. This requires ODCs to complete a thorough internal audit process that ensures that they connect with other relevant information stewards at their agencies, including public communications officials, FOIL officers, and database administrators.

The dataset questionnaire was presented as an Excel workbook with the following sections:

- **Agency Overview:** Description of the agency, its data sources, and its technical systems

- **Current Baseline:** Inventory and data quality questionnaire for datasets already on the Open Data Portal
- **MMR:** Inventory of Mayor's Management Report (MMR) indicators and underlying datasets
- **Reports:** Inventory of mandated reports and underlying datasets. Similar to the MMR section, this section aims to identify whether the most granular information used to calculate metrics in public reports is available on the Open Data Portal
- **Shared:** Inventory of datasets shared between agencies for operational purposes
- **FOIL:** Inventory of datasets used to respond to freedom of information law (FOIL) requests
- **Dataset Requests:** Responses to datasets requested by the public

Organizational Chart

The organizational chart familiarizes MODA and agency ODCs with each bureau, division, and reporting relationship within the agency. The dataset questionnaire requires ODCs to work across the organizational chart, giving them an opportunity to better understand their agency's information ecosystem while examining the business functions and personnel that have already contributed data to the Open Data Portal.

Executive Certification Letter (Appendix B)

MODA requires agency leadership to sign a certification letter modeled after the letter all Agency commissioners signed when they submitted their first Open Data compliance plans in 2013. In this statement, an agency's Commissioner or their designee, and the agency's General Counsel or their designee, certifies the completeness and accuracy of the information provided in the dataset questionnaire.

Dataset Requests

Users always have the option to nominate datasets for publication on the Open Data Portal at opendata.cityofnewyork.us/engage. Agency ODCs are required to review and respond to these requests for new datasets.

Debrief Interview (Appendix C)

Following the examination process, MODA met with ODCs to discuss the challenges and opportunities they face in the Open Data Coordinator role, which are reflected in the "Recommendations for Better Citywide Compliance" section of this report.

Summary of Results

In completing the due diligence of examining existing information streams, each of the surveyed agencies identified at least one new dataset to publish on the Open Data Portal. These datasets are listed below and have been added to the dataset publishing schedule in the Open Data Plan, which can be found at bit.ly/2zF89Rj.

The data quality review allowed the agencies to assess existing datasets on the Open Data Portal to ensure the accuracy of records relative to their source systems. In one case, this resulted in improvements to said dataset. In others, low-quality datasets that did not qualify as “Public Datasets” per Local Law 11 of 2012 were flagged for removal from the Portal.

Each agency’s full dataset inventory is included as an Excel workbook appendix to this report. These three workbooks are meant to provide Open Data users with a snapshot of the agencies’ systems and help them better understand how raw records become a usable dataset on the Open Data Portal.

Table 1. Overview of Agency Data Types

| Data Type | | DOB | FDNY | DEP |
|--------------------|--------------------------------------|-----|------|-----|
| Transactional Data | Licenses or Permits | Y | Y | Y |
| | Service Requests / Complaints | Y | N | Y |
| | Applications Initiated by the Public | Y | N | Y |
| Inventory Data | Surveys | N | Y | Y |
| | Assets Managed by Agency | Y | Y | Y |
| Operations Data | Inspections or Cases | Y | Y | Y |
| | Violations Issued | Y | Y | Y |

Department of Environmental Protection (DEP)

Agency Mission: The Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) protects public health and the environment by supplying clean drinking water, collecting and treating wastewater and reducing air, noise and hazardous materials pollution. The Department manages the City's water supply, which provides more than one billion gallons of high quality drinking water daily to more than half the population of New York State; builds and maintains the City's water distribution network, fire hydrants, storm and sanitary sewage collection systems and Bluebelt and green infrastructure systems; and manages 14 in-City wastewater treatment plants as well as seven treatment plants in the upstate watershed. DEP also implements federal Clean Water Act rules and regulations, handles hazardous materials emergencies and toxic site remediation, oversees asbestos monitoring and removal, enforces the City's air and noise codes, bills and collects on approximately 836,000 water and sewer accounts and manages citywide water conservation programs.

Table 2. DEP Newly Identified Datasets

| Dataset Name | Description | Release Date |
|--|--|--------------|
| Monitoring for Cryptosporidium and Giardia | Analytical results of sampling at the effluent of the Kensico Reservoir on the Catskill Delaware System and the influent to the Croton Filtration Plant. | 7/1/2017 |
| Current Reservoir Levels | The daily capacity and percent of capacity filled for each of the City's reservoirs. | 12/31/2018 |
| Current Releases | The daily release rates from the Catskill and Delaware system reservoirs: Ashokan, Cannonsville, Pepacton and Neversink. | 12/31/2018 |
| Fire Hydrant Coordinates | Geographic location of all fire hydrants maintained by the Department. | 7/1/2017 |
| Catch Basin Coordinates | Geographic location of all catch basins maintained by the Department. | 7/1/2017 |
| Lead Service Line Location Coordinates | Geographic location of lead water service lines. | 1/1/2018 |

Data Quality improvements: DEP identified a number of datasets currently on the Open Data Portal that did not constitute a "Public Dataset." In accordance with the Open Data Team's dataset archiving policy, the removal of these datasets from the Open Data Portal will improve data hygiene and the quality of the Portal's search function.

Fire Department of New York (FDNY)

Agency Mission: As first responders to fires, public safety and medical emergencies, disasters and terrorist acts, FDNY protects the lives and property of New York City residents and visitors. The Department advances public safety through its fire prevention, investigation and education programs. The timely delivery of these services enables the FDNY to make significant contributions to the safety of New York City and homeland security efforts.

Table 3. FDNY Newly Identified Datasets

| Dataset Name | Description | Release Date |
|-----------------------|--|--------------|
| Call Box Locations | Location of operational Call Boxes | 1/1/2018 |
| Mandatory Inspections | Mandatory Inspections performed by uniformed personnel | 1/1/2018 |

Data Quality improvements: FDNY identified a number of datasets currently on the Open Data Portal that did not constitute a “Public Dataset.” In accordance with the Open Data Team’s dataset archiving policy, the removal of these datasets from the Open Data Portal will improve data hygiene and the quality of the Portal’s search function.

Department of Buildings (DOB)

Agency Mission: The Department of Buildings promotes the safety of all people that build, work, and live in New York City by regulating the lawful use of over one million buildings and construction sites across the five boroughs. With a focus on safety, service, and integrity, the Department enforces the City’s Construction Codes, Zoning Resolution, and the New York State Multiple Dwelling Law.

Table 4. DOB Newly Identified Datasets

| Dataset Name | Dataset Description | Release Date |
|------------------------|---|--------------|
| DOB Building Occupancy | Certificates of occupancy for buildings | 6/30/2017 |

Data Quality improvements: The Examination and Verification identified problems with the existing data for the DOB Permit Issuance dataset on the Open Data Portal. DOB resolved and instituted additional quality control measures for this dataset.

Recommendations for Better Citywide Compliance

In the 2016 E&V report, MODA wrote that empowering Open Data Coordinators was fundamental to ensuring compliance with the Open Data Law. In the past twelve months, the Open Data team has taken additional steps to better understand the needs of Open Data Coordinators, including surveying ODCs, developing informational assets and standard operating procedures, and regularly convening Open Data Coordinators to encourage the exchange of best practices across agencies (**Appendix D**).

This year's E&V process shed additional light on the complexity of the Open Data Coordinator experience – namely, that the needs of every Open Data Coordinator are unique to their own agency.

Each agency is unique

City agencies have various missions, operations, and technical systems. These missions and histories reflect how they prioritize data management, what resources are allocated to open data functions, and where open data is organizationally located in the agency. The Department of Environmental Protection, for instance, is both a public safety and revenue collecting agency. The Fire Department provides emergency services. The Department of Buildings focuses on enforcement activity. Each of these agencies has a history of engaging different New Yorkers in different ways, resulting in different data governance mechanisms and priorities for their Open Data programs. As a result, the Open Data Program reflects not a singular, but in fact dozens of unique data publishing strategies.

*Recommendation: The **Open Data Team** should help Open Data Coordinators craft Open Data strategies unique to their agencies and provide additional documentation on open data organizational structures, return on investment, and compliance best practices.*

Executive buy-in is crucial

For many agencies, large investments in open data publishing are difficult to justify, especially for those that do not have systems or personnel to interface with the public on their data inventories. Executive buy-in is necessary to provide adequate resources for a robust agency open data program. In addition, data owners at the agency-level may misinterpret publishing data as a liability. Regular communication from Agency leadership is crucial for creating incentives among data owners to publish data more widely. DEP cited executive buy-in at the onset of the Open Data program as a key factor in its success at the agency.

*Recommendation: **The Mayor's Office** should regularly communicate the Administration's ongoing commitment to ensuring the success of Open Data – not just as a transparency goal, but also as a data governance policy with well-documented return on investment.*

*Recommendation: **MODA** should develop internal awareness campaigns to assist Open Data Coordinators in making more agency staff aware of the benefits of Open Data.*

Open Data is an opportunity to teach users how City operations work

Data records on Open Data describe business processes at agencies that may not otherwise be visible to the public. For instance, different datasets from FDNY represent not only its activities to respond to emergencies but the details of its efforts to prevent fires. Transactions logged in certain DOB datasets shed light on the different steps in application approval timelines. Columns in DEP datasets indicate what information the agency deems important in providing clean water to New Yorkers. This information represents an opportunity to teach the public how City agencies work.

*Recommendation: **Agencies** should assess demand for public information across multiple public-facing touch points – including dataset requests, public records requests, and 311 service requests – and work with **MODA** to identify ways in which they can proactively engage public stakeholders through Open Data.*

Open Data drives data governance and data analytics

When ODCs broker conversations about data publishing, data owners at the agencies begin to think about the other users, internally and externally, who might benefit from the data. These conversations cultivate more collegiality around data as a shared asset, which facilitates better information stewardship internally. In addition, considering opportunities for data reuse is the foundation of advanced analytics and data science use cases.

*Recommendation: **MODA** should continue to demonstrate the value of open data for data governance and analytics use cases through its Open Source Analytics Project Library and additional channels.*

Open Data coordinators must be well-networked

For Open Data Coordinators to be successful, they must have a good command of the agency's lines of business and personnel – a perspective that requires a certain degree of seniority and cross-functionality. This is not necessarily intuitive when assigning the role at the agency. Further, executing an open data program at the agency level requires a significant amount of time and effort; in particular, it requires working with a variety of internal and external stakeholders across data management roles. At DOB, this is accomplished by an internal data governance committee. At DEP, these functions are organizationally located within the purview of the ODC.

*Recommendation: **MODA** should provide proactive guidance to Agency commissioners on ODC selection.*

Recommendation: **Agencies** should have internal, cross-functional data governance teams that regularly convene and have Open Data on the agenda.

Recommendation: **MODA** and **DoITT** should align Open Data reporting with other reporting requirements, including performance reporting and public records requests, to build on existing resource allocations for process efficiencies.

Organizational knowledge retention is a challenge

Creating metadata at a level of detail required for a non-technical audience was cited by ODCs as a challenge. Often, detailed contextual information on a dataset exists only as tacit knowledge with specific individuals at an agency. Identifying personnel across the IT and business functions related to a given dataset and documenting their knowledge can be a burdensome process for ODCs. In addition, ODCs cited challenges that accompany turnover, such as inheriting undocumented processes and data without quality checks.

Recommendation: When an ODC leaves their position, **MODA** and **DOITT** should provide proactive support to assist in handoff to ensure smooth transition and knowledge transfer.

Recommendation: **MODA** and **DOITT** should investigate tools for metadata documentation and management.

Recommended Reading

“2016 Open Data Examination and Verification Report.” December 1, 2016. <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/analytics/initiatives/examination-and-verification-2016-findings-report.page>

“Open Data for All.” July 15, 2017. <http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/home/downloads/pdf/reports/2015/NYC-Open-Data-Plan-2015.pdf>

“Open Data for All: 2017 Progress Report.” July 15, 2017. <https://moda-nyc.github.io/2017-Open-Data-Report/>

“Understanding the Users of Open Data: Research Findings.” May 2017. [Opendata.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Understanding-the-Users-of-Open-Data_Reboot.pdf](http://opendata.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Understanding-the-Users-of-Open-Data_Reboot.pdf)

“About Open Source Analytics.” October 2017. <https://moda-nyc.github.io/Project-Library/analytics/>

Appendix A: Local Law 8 of 2016

Passed by New York City Council on December 16, 2015 and approved by the Mayor on January 5, 2016.

Introduced by Council Members Vacca, Koo, Constantinides, Greenfield, Kallos, Mealy and Vallone.

A LOCAL LAW

In relation to an open data law agency compliance examination.

Be it enacted by the Council as follows:

Section 1. Open data law agency compliance examination. a. An office or agency designated by the mayor shall conduct a series of examinations and verifications, as described in subdivision c, and make recommendations to improve the disclosure and inclusion of all public data sets required to be on the single web portal pursuant to section 23-502 of the administrative code of the city of New York.

b. Within 60 days of the effective date of this local law, an office or agency designated by the mayor shall present to the commissioner of investigation a plan for conducting the examinations and verifications described in subdivision c. The commissioner of investigation shall review such plan to ensure that it conforms with either a generally accepted auditing process or a process that the department of investigation would itself use in such an examination. The commissioner of investigation shall report to both the mayor and the council when a plan has been approved. The office or agency designated by the mayor may amend the plan with the approval of the commissioner of investigation.

c. Not later than December 1, 2016, and each December 1 thereafter for the next two years, the office or agency designated by the mayor shall conduct an examination and verification of the compliance with the requirements of subdivision a of section 23-502 of the administrative code of the city of New York, of no less than three mayoral agencies and submit the findings of such examination and verification to the mayor, the council and the examined mayoral agencies. Such findings shall include a list of all public data sets that such mayoral agencies did not make available on the single web portal in accordance with subdivision a of section 23-502 of the administrative code of the city of New York or disclose in the agency compliance plan required by section 23-506 of the administrative code of the city of New York as of the date of the findings, as well as a description of any deviations in the examination and verification process from the plan approved pursuant to subdivision b. For the findings due December 1, 2016, the mayoral agencies examined shall at a minimum consist of the department of sanitation, the department of correction and the department of housing preservation and development. For the findings due December 1, 2017, the mayoral agencies examined shall at a minimum consist of the department of buildings, the department of

environmental protection and the fire department. For the findings due December 1, 2018, the mayoral agencies examined shall at a minimum consist of the business integrity commission, the department of transportation and the department of small business services. In preparing such findings, the office or agency designated by the mayor shall accept suggestions from the public as to possible public data sets within mayoral agencies that have not yet been disclosed.

d. Not later than December 1, 2019, the office or agency designated by the mayor shall submit a written report to the mayor and the council describing the city's compliance with the requirements of subdivision a of section 23-502 of the administrative code of the city of New York, including a complete list of public data sets discovered by the office or agency designated by the mayor that were not previously made available on the single web portal or disclosed in the agency compliance plan and recommendations to improve the disclosure and inclusion of all public data sets required to be on the single web portal. In preparing this report, the office or agency designated by the mayor shall also accept suggestions from the public as to possible public data sets within mayoral agencies that have not yet been disclosed.

e. The report and findings required by this local law shall be posted on the city's website no later than ten days after being submitted.

§ 2. This local law takes effect immediately.

Appendix B: Executive Certification Letter template

As the Commissioner of _____, or their designee, I do hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, information, and reasonable belief, the attached inventory, submitted pursuant to said agency's obligations under Local Law 8 of 2016, is accurate and completes all reporting requirements as specified by the Mayor's Office of Data Analytics (MODA).

I affirm that said agency's General Counsel or other senior legal counsel has reviewed this inventory and confirmed that all datasets listed therein have been evaluated according to the definition of "public dataset," as defined in Local Law 11 of 2012, for publication on the Open Data Portal.

Furthermore, I affirm that this submission contains a complete list of all datasets that are updated and maintained on said agency websites, pursuant to Local Law 110 of 2015, and all new public datasets that have been released through said agency's responses to Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) requests, pursuant to Local Law 7 of 2016.

If such public dataset or sets cannot be made available on the Open Data Portal on or before December 31, 2018, this inventory states the reasons why such set or sets cannot be made available and, to the extent practicable, the date by which the said agency believes that it will be available.

Commissioner signature

Printed name

Title

Date

Legal counsel signature

Printed name

Title

Date

Appendix C: Open Data Coordinator Debrief Interview Template

In addition to the verification of agency compliance with the Open Data Law, Local Law 8 of 2016 requires MODA to recommend ways to improve the City's open data program at large. MODA asks that agencies involved in the process meet for a "debrief" interview to discuss the challenges and opportunities Open Data Coordinators face, which helps MODA reflect those agencies' needs in overall program strategy and written recommendations to City Council.

Objectives:

- Learn the lifecycle from record creation to data publishing in agency
- Learn about organizational structure of agency data publishing teams
- Learn about agency pain points
- Learn about agency's priorities for open data program
- Improve E&V process

Questions:

1. E&V process:
 - a. What, if anything, was useful about the E&V workbook? What should be changed?
 - b. Was 2 months a reasonable amount of time to complete the dataset questionnaire?
 - c. What advice would you give to agencies going through this process next year?
2. Data publishing lifecycle questions:
 - a. How do you identify pre-existing and new datasets for publication?
 - b. Once the dataset is identified, how to decide what attributes to include? How does privacy/security play a role?
 - c. Who writes the metadata/data dictionary?
 - d. How do you decide which datasets need automated feeds?
 - e. How do you determine if something is private/public?
3. Who from legal, comms, or leadership needs to be involved, and at which steps?
4. Are you aware of who uses open data within or outside your agency?
 - a. What would you be willing to do to engage more directly with them?
5. Are you aware when your agency sets up a data feed to another agency or outside entity? How could that be rolled into the open data process?
6. What would you like to see changed about the open data program?
7. What resources do you need in order to do your job effectively?
8. Would you want to play a bigger role in citywide governance of open data?

Appendix D: Open Data Coordinator Engagements in 2017

Dates of Open Data Coordinator Convenings (in-person and virtual attendance):

February 15

April 5

May 10

July 25

October 10

Open Data Coordinator Onboarding Sessions:

September 19: 10 attendees

October 12: 1 attendee

Individual session held due to schedule conflicts: 1

Open Data Coordinators onboarded to new customer service tool: 8

Department of Buildings

Department of City Planning

Department of Education

Department of Health & Mental Hygiene

Department of Information Technology & Telecommunications

Department of Parks & Recreation

Fire Department

Taxi & Limousine Commission

Open Data Coordinator Surveys Conducted:

General Open Data Coordinator Survey

Focus: Understanding how long ODCs had been in their roles, resources at their disposal, awareness level of Open Data among peers within their agency, resources they'd like from the Open Data Team, and interest level in having regular ODC convenings managed by the Open Data Team

Deployed: December 2016

Closed: January 2017

Survey engagement:

- 35 individual responses to the survey—a 59% completion rate
- 32, or 64% of open data agency partners are currently represented in the survey

Key Findings & Recommendations:

- ODCs' roles vary by agency; there's a need to outline an 'ideal' candidate for ODC and communicate the requirements of this role to agency heads during recruitment.
- ODCs need training and support to understand their responsibilities; especially given that they spend time fulfilling other roles and the amount of time spent on Open Data weekly varies across ODCs.
- There is a need to raise awareness across all levels of Agency staff & leadership about the existence and relevance of the Open Data Portal.
- ODCs have the desire & need for support as a cohort from each other & the Open Data Team.

2017 Open Data Compliance Report Survey

Focus: Feedback to the Open Data Team on the process for the 2017 Open Data Compliance Report and data publishing process; also an opportunity for ODCs to opt-out of their role.

Deployed: July 2017

Closed: August 2017

Survey engagement:

- 16 individual responses, each individual representing their agency - 25% completion rate

Key Findings & Recommendations:

- Given ODC turnover, the Open Data Team should provide training to ODCs pre-compliance season to help with preparation and to set expectations on work required
- Early engagement, and the development of supporting resources, by the Open Data Team to support agencies in compliance reporting were well-received and appreciated by ODCs
- ODCs continue to express a desire for more resources and support from the Open Data Team